Policy Brief

Addressing Socio-Economic Inequality: Decent Work in CAREC'S Green and Digital Transitions

in Kazakhstan

Alma Kudebayeva,
Kuat Akizhanov, *and*
Ilhom Abdulloev

April 2026

Disclaimer

The CAREC Institute policy brief series is a forum for stimulating discussion and eliciting feedback on ongoing and recently completed projects and workshops undertaken by CAREC Institute's staff, consultants or resource persons. The series deals with key economic and development issues, particularly those facing the CAREC region, as well as conceptual, analytical, or methodological issues relating to project/program economic analysis, and statistical data and measurement.

This policy brief, authored by Alma Kudebayeva and jointly edited by Kuat Akizhanov and Ilhom Abdulloev, draws on the research report "Addressing Socio-Economic Inequality: Decent Work in CAREC'S Green and Digital Transitions." The research was funded by ADB technical assistance (TA-6694 REG: Supporting the Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation Institute).

The views expressed in this policy brief are the views of the author and do not necessarily reflect the views or policies of the CAREC Institute, its funding entities, or its Governing Council. The CAREC Institute does not guarantee accuracy of the data included in this policy brief and accepts no responsibility for any consequences of its use. The terminology used may not necessarily be consistent with the CAREC Institute's official terms. The CAREC Institute accepts no liability or responsibility for any party's use of this policy brief or for the consequences of any party's reliance on the information or data provided herein.

By making any designation of or reference to a particular territory or geographical area, or by using country names in the policy brief, the author did not intend to make any judgment as to the legal or other status of any territory or area. Boundaries, colors, denominations, or any other information shown on maps do not imply any judgment on the legal status of any territory, or any endorsement or acceptance of such boundaries, colors, denominations, or information.

Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation (CAREC) Institute
21st Floor, Commercial Building Block 8, Vanke Metropolitan,
No. 66 Longteng Road, Shuimogou District, Urumqi, Xinjiang, the PRC, 830028
f: +86-991-8891151
LinkedIn: carec-institute
km@carecinstitute.org
www.carecinstitute.org

Executive Summary

This policy brief examines how Kazakhstan can harness its digital and green transitions to support inclusive and sustainable growth. It reviews the current policy context, highlights risk of unequal adjustment, and identifies actionable measures to expand digital access, promote a just energy transition, and strengthen social protections. The focus is on practical levers that can help ensure that the benefits help reduce rather than widen existing socio-economic divides.

Since 2000, Kazakhstan has made significant progress in its development, achieving high economic growth (averaging around 10% per year from 2000 to 2007), as well as large reductions in poverty (World Bank, 2025). However, in recent years, the country has faced a different set of challenges, including the economic and social impacts of the COVID-19 pandemic, rising inflationary pressures, and persistent socio-economic inequality. The latter is reflected in income, gender, and regional disparities: rural poverty remains substantially higher than in urban areas, with 7% of rural residents living in poverty compared to 4.1% in urban areas (United Nations, 2024); women earn on average 25% less than men (Bureau of National Statistics, 2025); and access to higher paying jobs and better infrastructure is concentrated in urban areas (Seitz, 2018; OECD, 2025).

Existing inequalities are shaping Kazakhstan's green and digital transitions. For example, telecommunication infrastructure and better-quality internet access are concentrated in urban areas, while rural communities' risk being left further behind in the digital economy. In the green transition, regions dependent on fossil fuel production face greater adjustment pressures and fewer alternative job opportunities for those affected, echoing broader disparities in economic resilience across the country. Without targeted actions, these shifts could widen rather than close socio-economic divides.

To ensure Kazakhstan's green and digital transitions narrow — not widen — existing divides, policy should prioritize:

1. *Digital inclusion with service delivery upgrades.* Expand rural broadband and speeds, and pilot further digitization of public services (e.g., online vocational registration; Targeted Social Assistance access) to reach women, youth and lagging regions.
2. *A just transition and decent work in carbon-intensive regions.* Set up a labor/skills-intelligence platform to map real-time demand; launch green public employment in coal/mining areas linked to short vocational certificates; formalize employer–TVET (Technical and Vocational Education and Training) partnerships with performance-based co-financing; and scale green and digital skills via Enbek.kz with completion incentives for NEET youth and informal workers.
3. *Targeted social equity measures.* Maintain and expand programs like Targeted Social Assistance for vulnerable households, especially in rural areas where poverty is higher than in cities. This will help households withstand transition shocks.
4. *Stronger data, transparency and coordination.* Establish a national labor-market intelligence system to track green job trends and skills gaps; strengthen municipal capacity for local climate/energy plans to coordinate delivery.

Introduction

The twin digital and green transitions are reshaping economies across the globe (World Economic Forum, 2025). On one hand, digitalization is creating new opportunities for flexible work, innovation, and improved service delivery. On the other, rapid technological change has deepened digital divides and raised concerns about skills gaps, security, and uneven access. Similarly, the shift toward greener growth offers prospects for cleaner industries, energy efficiency, and new sources of employment, but also poses challenges for countries reliant on fossil fuels and carbon-intensive sectors.

For Kazakhstan, these twin transitions are unfolding at a critical juncture. The country has set ambitious targets, including carbon neutrality by 2060 and accelerated digital transformation across the economy and public services. Progress has been made in areas such as e-government and renewable energy, yet uneven access to infrastructure, persistent skills mismatches, and dependence on fossil fuel-based employment risk undermining the inclusivity of these transformations.

Methodology

This policy brief covers study and visions from CAREC regional report "Addressing Socio-Economic Inequality: Decent Work in CAREC's Green and Digital Transitions" and is the duplication of the methods used in the main study. Mixed-methods approach is used to evaluate Kazakhstan's socio-economic inequality, decent work indicators in connection to green transition and digital transformation. The analysis is based on:

- *Secondary quantitative data analysis*. The following indices and datasets are applied such as the Human Development Index (HDI), Social Progress Index (SPI), Network Readiness Index (NRI), and decent work indicators from National Bureau of Statistic of Kazakhstan, accompanied by OECD, ILO, and World Bank datasets.
- *Examination of state programs and policies*, similarly, Kazakhstan's tasks under international arrangements.
- *Key Informant Interviews* (KIIs) and *Focus Group Discussions* (FGDs) were conducted to compliment quantitative data. KIIs with stakeholders from government, academia, and international organizations covered the challenges in application of state programs and institutional gaps. FGDs with youth, mid-career professionals from healthcare, education, construction, IT, logistics, and energy who live in Almaty revealed existing patterns of inequality, skills gaps, and opportunities in green and digital transition.
- *Empirical estimation using a Linear Probability Model for usage of online government services*. Our explanatory variable: a Digital Skills Index (DSI) constructed using the two-parameter logistic model (2PL) within the framework of Item Response Theory. The primary data is the 2021 Household Survey on ICT usage, conducted by Kazakhstan's Bureau of National Statistics.

Literature Review

Beyond income and wealth disparities at the national level (Akizhanov, 2025), recent evidence highlights another, equally important dimension of inequality in Kazakhstan manifested in stark regional disparities in well-being. Rodriguez-Pose et al. (2024), drawing on Kazakhstan's first Regional Well-Being Survey conducted in 2022, provides one of the most comprehensive assessments to date. The authors report deep regional disparities in wellbeing, where resource-rich regions such as Atyrau and Almaty have citizens reporting high wellbeing, whereas many rural regions particularly in the south and east (e.g., Turkestan, East Kazakhstan, Zhambyl, and Kyzylorda) lag behind. Kudebayeva and Sätre (2024) find that rural inequality declined between 2018 and 2021 due to targeted social

assistance implemented by the government. Interestingly, inequality at the district level is a significant driver of overall inequality and has negative effects on household wellbeing. Moreover, poor health outcomes were strongly linked to income levels and living conditions (Spankulova et al., 2020).

Several reforms were introduced in the 2000s and 2010s to ease Kazakhstan's regulatory burden and combat informality. These included reducing the number of licensed activities and simplifying business registration procedures (Rutkowski, 2011; OECD, 2012). The government also took active steps to mitigate informality through SME development. In 2012, the government announced its intention to double the SME sector's contribution to GDP by 2030, embedded in the "Kazakhstan-2050" long-term development strategy (Mussurov & Arabsheibani, 2015). The Labor Codes of 2007 and 2015 introduced legal recognition of part-time and multiple-job contracts, and complementing these reforms, the 2017 Tax Code introduced measures to simplify reporting procedures and provided clearer incentives for taxpayers (Tatibekov & Fatehi, 2020).

Policy Context

Digital Transition

Kazakhstan has made notable advances in digitalization over the past decade, positioning itself as a regional leader in Central Asia. The country ranks 61st out of 133 economies in the 2024 Network Readiness Index, second only to China among CAREC members. Its strongest indicators include e-commerce legislation, adult literacy, and government online services, where Kazakhstan places among the global top ten.

Progress has been supported by initiatives such as the *Digital Kazakhstan* programme (2018–2022), which expanded ICT infrastructure, fostered innovation hubs such as Astana Hub, and accelerated the rollout of e-government platform. Nearly universal mobile coverage has been achieved in urban areas, and the number of rural residents with access to fiber-optic speeds increased from 100,000 to 800,000 between 2018 and 2020. Kazakhstan now ranks 24th globally on the UN's E-Government Development Index, up from 39th in 2018 (UNDESA, 2024).

Despite these gains, structural challenges remain. Rural broadband quality lags urban areas, mobile internet speeds remain poor, and adoption of digital technologies by firms is still limited (only 11% of businesses). The regulatory framework has been slow and inconsistent, while cybersecurity vulnerabilities are widespread, particularly among SMEs. These constraints risk limiting Kazakhstan's ability to harness digitalization for inclusive growth.

Green Transition

Kazakhstan has also committed to ambitious green development goals. Under its *Concept for Transition to a Green Economy up to 2050*, the country targets 50% of energy from renewables by 2050 and achieve carbon neutrality by 2060 (although the 2060 goal is a non-binding policy ambition). The 2023 Decarbonization Strategy embeds Environmental, Social, and Governance (ESG) principles, envisions the gradual introduction of cost-reflective tariffs with targeted social assistance, and promotes digital monitoring of emissions.

The urgency of this transition is clear. The energy sector accounts for 77% (excluding LULUCF) of Kazakhstan's greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions in 2021. About half (46.4% in 2022) of these emissions came from electricity generation, which continues to rely on coal as the primary source of feedstock (with coal-fired generation comprising 70% of all power generation). Reducing GHG emissions long-

term will require a reduction in coal-fired generation and an uptick in natural-gas generation as well as renewables (National Energy Report, 2023).

At the same time, the transition offers opportunities. Energy efficiency measures can create jobs in retrofitting, auditing, and clean construction, while renewables development can stimulate SMEs and green finance. Kazakhstan has also joined global initiatives such as the Global Methane Pledge, aligning domestic reforms with international commitments. Yet fossil-fuel dependence, government pricing policies (which must balance ensuring cost-parity for the producers with the need to provide affordable energy to end-users) present obstacles to ensuring the transition is socially fair and economically inclusive.

Analysis of Major Findings

Digitalization

While Kazakhstan's digital and green policy frameworks set an ambitious trajectory, the key issue for policymakers is ensuring the benefits from these transitions are evenly distributed. Progress in infrastructure and regulations does not automatically translate into broad-based inclusion. Evidence shows that without deliberate focus; structural divides can persist or even deepen.

To better understand these dynamics, we analyze nationally representative survey data of 56,649 adults collected in 2021. The focus is on uptake of e-government services, a proxy for how citizens engage with digital infrastructure and the state. To isolate the role of digital skills, we construct a digital literacy index and control for socioeconomic and demographic factors. The reason for choosing this survey was its comprehensive coverage of ICT usage across different demographics and the availability of fairly recent data.

For the study, a Linear Probability Model was used. The dependent (binary) variable is whether an individual uses government services via the Internet. Explanatory variables include individual and household characteristics such as gender, educational attainment, place of residence, age and our digital skills index.

A Digital Skills Index (DSI) had been constructed using the two-parameter logistic model (2PL) within the framework of Item Response Theory. The 2PL model was chosen as it allows to analyze binary responses, while also accounting for varying task difficulty and measure discrimination–i.e. how well each ICT task differentiates between individuals with different levels of digital skills. In essence, DSI provides an accurate assessment of individual digital competencies, with an emphasis on functional and work-relevant ICT competencies. Hence higher DSI scores indicate greater digital proficiency. The index is based on 'Yes/No' responses to the survey questions listed in Table 3 in the Appendix.

The results reveal a clear divide in accessing and using e-government services in Kazakhstan, across regions, socio-economic status, and digital skills. The lower engagement amongst those with little education, no employment, elderly and from rural areas suggests that current e-government platforms may not be fully inclusive and emphasizes the need to introduce targeted programs to help those individuals improve their digital literacy. This is especially important given that many government services are being digitized and access to key public services is moving online.

The empirical findings show:

- Digital literacy and education are the strongest predictors of e-government usage. Uptake rises sharply with education level, from secondary to university graduates.

- Labor market status matters: wage workers are more likely to use online public services, while students, pensioners, and the unemployed are each about seven percentage points less likely.
- Regional divides are pronounced. The three largest cities—Astana, Almaty, and Shymkent—consistently outperform other regions, highlighting urban-rural inequalities in access and adoption.

These patterns suggest that digitalization in Kazakhstan risks amplifying existing social divides. Those with limited education, no stable employment, or living in rural areas are the least likely to benefit from digital public services. For them, digitalization can create new barriers rather than opportunities.

Green Transition

Kazakhstan's green transition is unfolding against a backdrop of heavy dependence on fossil fuels. The energy sector generates 84% of total emissions, with coal, oil, and gas supplying over 90% of electricity (Word Bank, 2022). Despite recent progress—renewables now account for 6.5% of the energy mix (or generation mix)—years of underinvestment have left generation capacity outdated, and the grid strained, culminating in electricity demand outstripping supply in 2023 (EBRD, 2024). These structural weaknesses pose risks not only to decarbonization but also to energy security.

The social and regional implications are equally uneven. That is, coal-dependent regions such as Karaganda and Pavlodar face concentrated risks of job losses as fossil fuel assets are retired, while urban centers are better positioned to attract renewable investment and capture new employment opportunities. At the household level, higher energy tariffs and limited access to financing make poorer and rural households more exposed, while wealthier urban families are better placed to adopt new technologies such as rooftop solar or heat pumps.

In other words, benefits such as green jobs, SME growth, and clean energy access risk being concentrated in urban areas and wealthier groups, while fossil-fuel regions and low-income households bear the adjustment costs. The inclusivity of the transition will therefore depend less on aggregate investment levels and more on how well policy cushions vulnerable groups and redistributes opportunities across regions. Otherwise, Kazakhstan's ambitious strategies risk leaving behind the very populations most in need of better services, jobs, and protections.

Qualitative insights from focus groups in Kazakhstan

a) Youth perspectives on decent work, digitalization and green readiness. Eight university students were interviewed to ask about their experiences with digitalization, access to decent work and perceptions of the green economy. Digitalization was consistently seen as a major factor in improving workplace productivity, communication and ability to find a job. Work experience was noted as a major barrier for young people to find jobs even in entry level roles. Gender inequality and language barriers were noted as more broad challenges. Those living in rural areas can lack access to digital tools, decent education and experience language barriers.

"Inequality is enormous if a young person doesn't know how to use digital technologies… they're easily replaceable," — Student #1.

"You graduate, but you have no experience, and they don't want to hire you—that's the biggest problem," — Student #2

"If a rural youth moves to the city, it's hard—their salary doesn't match the cost of living," — Student #3

b) Perspectives from professionals on decent work, digitalization and green readiness. Six professionals were interviewed aged 31-46 from sectors including healthcare, education, construction, IT, logistics, and energy who live in Almaty. Participants defined decent work as employment where pay reflects effort, rights are upheld, and workload is reasonable; several have stated this is not reflected in their current roles. Participants described a workplace culture where refusing unpaid extra work is discouraged and compensation for hazardous work is often missing.

On digitalization, some reported positive outcomes such as improved efficiency and time savings at work, while others noted that infrastructure can be inadequate with poor connectivity and limited access to IT equipment.

Furthermore, participants expressed awareness of green practices such as smart meters, solar panels, and waste separation. Yet they pointed to major barriers that exist such as inconsistent implementation (e.g., sorted waste still collected in one truck), lack of infrastructure, affordability issues, and low public awareness. Several noted that environmental change requires both habit change and enforcement.

"In Kazakhstan, we've developed a certain mentality. That's why achieving decent work here is going to be difficult," – Respondent #1

"Because we have oil, coal, all the resources. Until it all runs out — we won't move to a green economy," – Respondent #2

"A green economy depends on the individual. But right now, we don't have the conditions for that, " – Respondent #3

Policy Options and Way Forward

Policy Options

Evidence from Kazakhstan's digital transition shows that education, digital literacy, employment status, and geography strongly determine uptake of e-services. Without intervention, these divides risk becoming entrenched. Similarly, the green transition presents opportunities for cleaner industries and new jobs, but coal dependence, outdated infrastructure, and weak regional capacity threaten inclusivity.

Policy options should therefore focus on:

- *Expanding digital inclusion.* Target investments in rural broadband and mobile internet speeds, while coupling infrastructure rollout with basic digital literacy and service-access training for low-education and unemployed groups.
- *Supporting a just energy transition.* Launch green public employment programs in coal-dependent regions (e.g., building retrofits, afforestation [where appropriate], solar installations) alongside short vocational certificates and incentives for employer–TVET partnerships.
- *Strengthening social protection.* Safeguard vulnerable households through Targeted Social Assistance and complementary programs that allow them to withstand shocks and benefit from new opportunities.
- *Improving data and coordination.* Establish a labor-market intelligence system to track skills demand and green job creation and equip municipalities to design and deliver local transition plans.

Implementation should follow a phased approach: pilot schemes in high-need regions, scale successful models nationally, and mobilize blended finance with support from international partners.

Ministries must coordinate closely with local governments, the private sector, and civil society to ensure delivery is inclusive and sustainable.

Implementation Steps

Delivering an inclusive digital and green transition in Kazakhstan requires phased and coordinated implementation. In the short term (1-2 years), the priority should focus on expanding digital literacy programs, pilot retraining schemes, especially in the coal-dependent regions, and improve access to ICT infrastructure in rural and remote areas. In the medium term (3-5 years), national systems for skills forecasting and green investment incentives should be established, alongside reforms in education and vocational training provision in order to integrate digital and green competencies. In the long term (5+ years), policy efforts should prioritize nationwide programs for just transition, scaling up renewable energy industries, and making digital services equally accessible in all regions.

Coordination should be led by core ministries including the Ministry of Labor and Social Protection of the Population, the Ministry of Digital Development, Innovation and Aerospace Industry, the Ministry of Energy, and the Ministry of Education (or, where appropriate, the Ministry of Science and Higher Education), supported by development partners (e.g., UNDP, World Bank, ADB).

Consultation Mechanism

For successful implementation, policy recommendations must be tested and policy efforts calibrated with stakeholders. Therefore, a multi-level consultation process is proposed with:

- National ministries;
- Local governments to adapt programs to regional and community needs;
- Employers, training providers, and trade unions to ensure labor-market relevance;
- NGOs, civil society and community groups to represent vulnerable groups, including women, youth, and rural residents;
- Development partners and international financial institutions to provide technical and financial assistance.

Consultations should combine policy dialogues and pilot projects, supported by structured feedback mechanisms (i.e. online feedback and formal public consultation periods), to ensure that policy measures are practical and inclusive.

Conclusion

The twin transition can produce twofold effects: driving sustainable growth while at the same time deepening inequality. Empirical evidence shows that digital adoption is strongly associated with education, employment status, age, and region. We find that uptake among highly educated individuals, employees, and urban residents is higher, while rural residents and the elderly are less likely to benefit from e-government services. In the green transition, the effect on local communities needs to be taken into consideration. For example, coal-producing regions such as Karaganda and Pavlodar would face disproportionate job losses. Furthermore, urban and affluent households are better placed when it comes to adopting new technologies and energy-efficient systems. These gaps are symptoms of existing inequalities (gender, regional, and income) that stubbornly persist despite Kazakhstan's economic growth and gains in poverty reduction.

It can be argued that without targeted policy interventions, these vulnerabilities may be exasperated as transitions gain traction and speed. The analysis shows that inclusive social outcomes would

require linking broadband expansion with training such as basic digital literacy programs, providing equitable transition in carbon-intensive and oil-rich regions through vocational training, and helping vulnerable groups through targeted social assistance. In this context, the key will be to establish a labor-market intelligence system, extend support to local governments in their efforts to design and implement most effective (in terms of distributional effect) transition plans, and make social protection benefit those most affected by the twin transitions in general.

Appendices

Table 1. Green transition policies in Kazakhstan

Policy/Regulatory Instrument	Responsible Ministry/Department	Key Focus
Concept on Transition to Green Economy (2013)	Ministry of Ecology and Natural Resources	Provides a long-term strategy for sustainable development through efficient resource use, reduced environmental impact, and economic diversification into green sectors such as water management, energy efficiency, and agriculture.
Environmental Code (2007, updated 2021)	Ministry of Ecology and Natural Resources	Establishes legal principles for environmental protection including the polluter-pays principle, mandatory use of the most effective technologies available to reduce pollution, and integration of climate adaptation into public decision-making.
Law on Renewable Energy (2009)	Ministry of Energy	Promotes the development and integration of renewable energy sources such as wind, solar, and hydroelectric power by offering incentives and establishing market mechanisms for clean energy production.
Emissions Trading System (2012)	Ministry of Ecology and Natural Resources	A market-based approach to controlling carbon dioxide emissions by allocating and trading emission allowances to incentivize reductions by the largest polluters.
Renewable Energy Auctions (2018)	Ministry of Energy	Implements competitive auctions to select and support renewable energy projects, helping reduce costs and increase private investment in clean energy.
Adaptation Framework in the Environmental Code	Ministry of Ecology and Natural Resources	Mainstreams climate adaptation into environmental governance, encouraging proactive planning against climate risks in all sectors.
Nationally Determined Contribution (2023)	Ministry of Ecology and Natural Resources	Represents Kazakhstan's official climate commitment under the Paris Agreement to reduce greenhouse gas emissions and reach carbon neutrality by the year 2060.
Strategy on Achieving Carbon Neutrality by 2060 (2023)	Ministry of Ecology and Natural Resources	Outlines a national roadmap to eliminate net greenhouse gas emissions across sectors including energy, industry, transport, agriculture, and land use.
Forestry and Land Use Policies	Ministry of Ecology and Natural Resources	Support reforestation and sustainable land management through afforestation projects, forest conservation programs, and promotion of climate-resilient agriculture.
Kazakhstan-2050 Strategy	Presidential Office	A long-term national development strategy that includes sustainability objectives such as increasing renewable energy, improving water efficiency, and ensuring ecological balance.
Strategic Plan until 2025	Ministry of National Economy	Focuses on green growth by enhancing energy efficiency, preserving biodiversity, and promoting sustainable infrastructure.

100 Concrete Steps – National Plan	Government of Kazakhstan	Introduces institutional reforms including those in the energy sector to attract green investment and strengthen environmental regulation.
Waste Management Reforms	Ministry of Ecology and Natural Resources	Aim to reduce landfill use and improve recycling through extended producer responsibility, waste separation requirements, and digital waste tracking systems.
State Program for Agricultural Development (2017–2021)	Ministry of Agriculture	Supports water-saving technologies, sustainable land use, and development of organic agriculture to build climate resilience in farming.
National Project 'Green Kazakhstan' (2021–2025)	Ministry of Ecology and Natural Resources	Includes initiatives for planting over two billion trees, improving air and water quality, and strengthening environmental monitoring systems.

Table 2. National policies and regulations on the digital economy for Kazakhstan

Policy/Regulatory Instrument	Responsible Ministry/Department	Key Focus
Digital Kazakhstan State Program (2017 Resolution No. 827)	Ministry of Digital Development, Innovations and Aerospace Industry	The national strategy to foster digital transformation in public services, industry, education, and infrastructure, enabling inclusive growth and technological modernization.
DigitEL Strategy (2022–2027)	Ministry of Digital Development, Innovations and Aerospace Industry	Aims to extend digital infrastructure nationwide, increase digital economy contributions to the gross domestic product, and improve digital public service delivery.
Technological Breakthrough through Digitalization, Innovation and Science (2021)	Ministry of Digital Development, Innovations and Aerospace Industry	A national project to advance innovation ecosystems, improve cybersecurity systems, and stimulate research and development in emerging technologies.
National Broadband Program (2023)	Telecommunications Committee under the Ministry of Digital Development, Innovations and Aerospace Industry	Aims to deliver high-speed broadband of at least 100 megabits per second to every household in the country, reducing the digital divide.
Digital Acceleration for an Inclusive Economy (DARE Project) (2024)	Telecommunications Committee under the Ministry of Digital Development, Innovations and Aerospace Industry	An initiative supported by the World Bank to promote inclusive broadband connectivity, mobilize private investment, and increase digital resilience.
Law on Amendments on Digital Technologies (2020)	Ministry of Digital Development, Innovations and Aerospace Industry	Provides legal foundation for data security, defines critical digital infrastructure, and mandates cybersecurity compliance.
Personal Data Law (2013)	Ministry of Digital Development, Innovations and Aerospace Industry	Ensures privacy rights and responsible use of personal data, with updated provisions promoting risk-based data localization.
Cybersecurity Law and Concept (Cyber Shield) (2017)	Ministry of Digital Development, Innovations and Aerospace Industry and National Security Committee	Outlines cybersecurity governance for national infrastructure and defines collaboration frameworks with private and international stakeholders.

Open Data Framework (2023)	Ministry of Digital Development, Innovations and Aerospace Industry	Supports transparent governance and economic innovation by enabling open access and reuse of government data.
Telecommunications Competition Reform (2022)	Ministry of Digital Development, Innovations and Aerospace Industry and Agency for Protection of Competition	Promotes investment and market liberalization in the telecommunications sector by reducing monopolistic practices.
Green ICT Standards (ITU-T, ISO)	Ministry of Digital Development, Innovations and Aerospace Industry and Ministry of Ecology and Natural Resources	Mandates the use of energy-efficient and sustainable practices in digital infrastructure development.
Climate-Resilient Infrastructure Standards	Ministry of Digital Development, Innovations and Aerospace Industry and Ministry of Ecology and Natural Resources	Promotes resilient digital infrastructure through climate-proof fiber optic and underground cabling systems.
Digital Code (last discussions in 2025)	Ministry of Digital Development, Innovations and Aerospace Industry	Establishes legal and institutional norms governing digital services, e-commerce, data security, and digital rights.

Table 3. Kazakhstan Household Survey questions for digital skills

N	Questions	Answers
1	Sending email with attached files (document, photo, video)	1 for “yes’ and 0 for “no”
2	Finding, downloading and installing software	1 for “yes’ and 0 for “no”
3	Setting up software, including changing the operating system or security programs	1 for “yes’ and 0 for “no”
4	Working in Excel spreadsheet software (using basic arithmetic formulas in tables)	1 for “yes’ and 0 for “no”
5	Working in Word text editor	1 for “yes’ and 0 for “no”
6	Working in graphics editor (including presentations, text, images, sound, video or charts)	1 for “yes’ and 0 for “no”
7	Connecting and installing new devices (printer, modem and camera)	1 for “yes’ and 0 for “no”
8	Developing computer programs using a special programming language	1 for “yes’ and 0 for “no”
9	Copying or moving a file or folder	1 for “yes’ and 0 for “no”
10	Using copy and paste tools to make copies or move information in a document	1 for “yes’ and 0 for “no”
11	Transferring files between computers and other devices	1 for “yes’ and 0 for “no”

References

Akizhanov, K. (2025). *Politicheskaya ekonomiya Kazakhstana. Ot neoliberal'noy dogmy k sotsial'noy katastrofe* [The political economy of Kazakhstan: From neoliberal dogma to social catastrophe]. Turan.

Bureau of National Statistics. (2025). Структура и распределение заработной платы работников в Республике Казахстан ["Structure and Distribution of Wages of Employees in the Republic of Kazakhstan."], Astana. Retrieved from: https://stat.gov.kz/ru/industries/labor-and-income/stat-wags/publications/184053/

European Bank for Reconstruction and Development (EBRD), 2024. *Transition Report 2024–25: Kazakhstan Country Assessment*. London: EBRD, 2024. Retrieved from: https://www.ebrd.com/content/dam/ebrd_dxp/assets/pdfs/office-of-the-chief-economist/transition-report-archive/transition-report-2024/country-assessments-2023-24/central-asia/Transition-Report-2024-25-Kazakhstan.pdf

Kudebayeva, A., & Sätre, A. (2024). Regional inequality and well-being of households in Kazakhstan: district-level analysis. *Journal of Economic Research & Business Administration*, *150*(4), 16–29. https://doi.org/10.26577/be.2024.150.i4.a2

Mussurov, A., & Arabsheibani, G.R. (2015) Informal self-employment in Kazakhstan. IZA J Labor Develop 4(9). https://doi.org/10.1186/s40175-015-0031-9

National Energy Report (2023). Kazakhstan Association of Oil, Gas and Energy Sector Organizations "KAZENERGY", Astana. Retrieved from: https://www.kazenergy.com/upload/document/energy-report/NationalReport23_en.pdf

Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD). (2012). *OECD Investment Policy Reviews: Kazakhstan 2012*, OECD Investment Policy Reviews, OECD Publishing, Paris. https://doi.org/10.1787/9789264121812-en.

Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD). (2025). Responsible Business Conduct for Sustainable Infrastructure in Kazakhstan, Mongolia and Uzbekistan. OECD Publishing. https://doi.org/10.1787/2762f803-en

Rodríguez-Pose, A., Bartalucci, F., Kurmanov, B., Rau, G., & Nigmetov, K. (2024). Assessing Regional Inequalities in Kazakhstan through Well-Being. *Asian Development Review*, 301–333. https://doi.org/10.1142/S0116110524500033

Rutkowski, J. (2011). *Promoting Formal Employment in Kazakhstan*. World Bank. Retrieved from: https://documents.worldbank.org/en/publication/documents-reports/documentdetail/296151468273286282

Seitz, W. H. (2018). *Urbanization in Kazakhstan: Desirable cities, unaffordable housing, and the missing rental market* (Policy Research Working Paper No. 8530). World Bank. https://doi.org/10.1596/1813-9450-8530

Spankulova, L., Karatayev, M., & Clarke, M. L. (2020). Trends in socioeconomic health inequalities in Kazakhstan: National household surveys analysis. *Communist and Post-Communist Studies, 53*(2), 177–190. Retrieved from: https://www.jstor.org/stable/48610581

Tatibekov, B., & Fatehi, K. (2020). Informal employment in the transitional economy of Kazakhstan. *Transactions of the ASAE, 18*(1–2), 208–223. American Society of Agricultural Engineers.

UNDESA (United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs). (2024). United Nations e-government Survey 2024: Accelerating Digital Transformation for Sustainable Development. Retrieved from: https://publicadministration.un.org/egovkb/en-us/Reports/UN-E-Government-Survey-2024

United Nations. (2024). *Common country analysis: Kazakhstan*. United Nations. Retrieved from: https://kazakhstan.un.org/en/289831-common-country-analysis-kazakhstan-2024

World Bank (2025). Kazakhstan Poverty and Equity Assessment 2024. World Bank. Retrieved from: https://hdl.handle.net/10986/42616

World Bank. (2022). Country Climate and Development Report: Kazakhstan. In *Country Climate and Development Report: Kazakhstan*. Retrieved from: https://openknowledge.worldbank.org/server/api/core/bitstreams/e91f4c4e-a61b-507d-bb91-a39c5ad2f499/content

World Economic Forum (2025). Unlocking the Social Economy: Towards Equity in the Green and Digital Transitions. Retrieved from: https://reports.weforum.org/docs/WEF_Unlocking_the_Social_Economy_2025.pdf