Standardizing Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET): A Force Multiplier for Regionalism

Fahad Khan
Economist, Regional Cooperation and Integration Division
Economic Research and Regional Cooperation Department (ERCD)
Asian Development Bank

Third CAREC Think Tanks Development Forum
17 July 2018 | Bishkek, Kyrgyz Republic
OUTLINE

• SETTING THE CONTEXT
• TVET AS A FORCE MULTIPLIER FOR REGIONALISM
• TVET STANDARDIZATION INSTRUMENTS
• TVET IN CAREC: OPPORTUNITIES AND CHALLENGES
• ISSUES AND CHALLENGES IN TVET STANDARDIZATION
• PRIORITY AREAS FOR REFORM AND WAY FORWARD
Primary References

• ADB. 2018. Tapping Technology to Maximize the Longevity Dividend in Asia.

• ADB. 2017. CAREC 2030: Connecting the Region for Shared and Sustainable Development.

• Batalova, J., A. Shymonyak, and G. Sugiyarto. 2017. Firing up regional brain networks: The promise of brain circulation in the ASEAN economic community. ADB.


• Mendoza, D. and G. Sugiyarto. 2017. The long road ahead: Status report on the implementation of the ASEAN mutual recognition arrangements on professional services. ADB.

• Mendoza et al. 2017. Reinventing mutual recognition arrangements: Lessons from International Experiences and Insights for the ASEAN Region. ADB.

• Papademetriou, et al. 2015. Achieving Skill Mobility in the ASEAN Economic Community: Challenges, Opportunities, and Policy Implications. ADB.

• Ra, S., B. Chin, and A. Liu. 2015. Challenges and opportunities for skills development in Asia: Changing supply, demand, and mismatches. ADB.
SETTING THE CONTEXT
Demographic Shift and Labor Supply

Reduced fertility and increased life expectancy

Aged, Aging
- PRC, Georgia, Kazakhstan
- 29% - 41% of population under the age of 25
- Increasing labor demand that outpaces labor supply

Young
- Afghanistan, Azerbaijan, Kyrgyz Republic, Mongolia, Pakistan, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan, Uzbekistan
- At least 37% of population under the age of 25
- Sustained population growth will continue to expand labor forces

Regional solution
Greater mobility of workers across the skills spectrum
### Educational Trends

**Rising Levels of Education**

#### Table 1: Enrollment in Tertiary Education, 1981 versus 2014

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Number</td>
<td>% Change</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Afghanistan</td>
<td>24,333</td>
<td>262,874</td>
<td>238,541</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Azerbaijan</td>
<td>160,900</td>
<td>195,401</td>
<td>34,501</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China, People's Rep. of</td>
<td>3,924,546</td>
<td>41,924,198</td>
<td>37,999,652</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Georgia</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>120,923</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kazakhstan</td>
<td>541,000</td>
<td>727,401</td>
<td>186,401</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kyrgyz Republic</td>
<td>105,300</td>
<td>267,920</td>
<td>162,620</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mongolia</td>
<td>40,038</td>
<td>175,205</td>
<td>135,167</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>304,922</td>
<td>1,931,875</td>
<td>1,626,953</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tajikistan</td>
<td>107,280</td>
<td>209,170</td>
<td>101,890</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turkmenistan</td>
<td>42,000</td>
<td>44,411</td>
<td>2,411</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uzbekistan</td>
<td>331,600</td>
<td>260,453</td>
<td>(71,147)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAREC</td>
<td>5,581,919</td>
<td>46,119,831</td>
<td>40,537,912</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CAREC = Central Asia Regional Economic Cooperation.

Note: Years refer to the earliest and latest years in which data are available for all member countries.

Educational Trends …

Table 2: Share of Adults with Completed Secondary and Tertiary Education, 1980 versus 2010

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>% of Population Age 15+ with Completed Secondary Schooling</th>
<th>% of Population Age 15+ with Completed Tertiary Schooling</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Afghanistan</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>8.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China, People’s Rep. of</td>
<td>9.4</td>
<td>22.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kazakhstan</td>
<td>32.1</td>
<td>66.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kyrgyz Republic</td>
<td>31.1</td>
<td>65.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mongolia</td>
<td>25.1</td>
<td>45.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>19.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tajikistan</td>
<td>41.4</td>
<td>62.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Data for Azerbaijan, Georgia, Turkmenistan, and Uzbekistan are unavailable.

## Educational Trends …

### Table 3: Annual Number of Graduates—Total and with Degrees in Select Professional Sectors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>Annual Graduates</th>
<th>Engineering, Manufacturing and Construction</th>
<th>Health and Welfare</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Afghanistan</td>
<td>24,315 (2014)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Georgia</td>
<td>22,711 (2016)</td>
<td>1,687 (2016)</td>
<td>2,007 (2016)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes: Data for Pakistan and Turkmenistan are unavailable.

# Educational Trends …

## Table 4: Skill Levels as Share of Total Employment, by Country (2017)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country</th>
<th>High (%)</th>
<th>Medium (%)</th>
<th>Low (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Afghanistan</td>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>83.1</td>
<td>13.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Azerbaijan</td>
<td>23.2</td>
<td>61.1</td>
<td>15.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>China, People's Rep. of</td>
<td>12.4</td>
<td>79.4</td>
<td>8.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Georgia</td>
<td>25.9</td>
<td>68.8</td>
<td>5.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kazakhstan</td>
<td>33.5</td>
<td>47.3</td>
<td>19.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kyrgyz Republic</td>
<td>18.3</td>
<td>73.0</td>
<td>8.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mongolia</td>
<td>24.7</td>
<td>67.9</td>
<td>7.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pakistan</td>
<td>21.0</td>
<td>61.6</td>
<td>17.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tajikistan</td>
<td>16.2</td>
<td>76.5</td>
<td>7.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Turkmenistan</td>
<td>19.4</td>
<td>71.5</td>
<td>9.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uzbekistan</td>
<td>19.8</td>
<td>71.8</td>
<td>8.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Data are ILO-modelled estimates.

Economic Trends

- Huge wage disparity

- Services are an important emerging sector in CAREC, with the group recording an annual average growth of about 15% in 2000-2016. There is scope to expand intraregional trade in some services—especially to tourism, transport, and other business services.
Implications of Megatrends

- Opportunities for greater human capital development and skills circulation within CAREC

- Regional and domestic labor forces are interlinked

*Greater labor mobility within the region given the right incentives and supporting mechanisms*
TVET AS A FORCE MULTIPLIER FOR REGIONALISM
TVET and its Benefits

TVET in UNESCO's Education 2030 Agenda

• A deeper level of economic integration calls for regional cooperation in skills development
• TVET can help address labor market skill needs, close skills gaps, and enhance productivity
• Systematic strategies at the policy level and development of common tools and principles fundamental to better facilitate labor migration and encourage skills mobility
TVET helps promote liberalization under Mode 4 Trade in Services

Figure 1: Total Services Trade By sector (2000—2016)

Travel
Transportation
Other business services
Construction services
Insurance services
Royalties and license fees
Computer and information services
Government services, n.i.e.
Financial services
Communications services
Personal, cultural, and recreational services

TVET’s important role in technology diffusion through knowledge and skills transfer

TVET systems enhancing the management of labour migration

TVET systems responding to migration through frameworks for mutual recognition of qualifications
TVET STANDARDIZATION INSTRUMENTS
Supporting mechanisms for mutual recognition

- **Joint certification programs**
  - Straightforward means of skills recognition

- **Regional qualifications framework**
  - Translation device to enable comparison and communication of national qualifications framework with a common regional reference framework

- **Mutual recognition arrangement (MRAs)**
  - Serves a process whereby the qualifications gained in the home country is recognized as such in the host country, with no need for recertification
Figure 2: Three Mutual Recognition Arrangements Routes

Source: Mendoza et al. 2017. Reinventing mutual recognition arrangements: Lessons from International Experiences and Insights for the ASEAN Region. ADB.
Key Lessons from International Experiences on MRAs

- The harmonization of training standards is hard to achieve and even harder to maintain.
- Centralized MRA systems require enormous resources to implement, while a decentralized approach, although less resource intensive, is difficult to monitor.
- Partial recognition can only be effective if guidelines for compensatory measures are clear and not unnecessarily complex.
- Umbrella agreements offer a promising, alternate approach to MRA negotiations—but only if there is political will at the highest levels.

MRAs are living documents that require constant revision, improvement, and even periodic renegotiation. Signing an MRA is just the critical first step. Without constant monitoring, evaluation, and revision, an MRA will not stand the test of time and could become easily irrelevant and costly to maintain.
# Mobility Agreements covering TVET

## Table 6: Mobility Agreements covering TVET

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Regional Bloc</th>
<th>Mobility Agreements</th>
<th>Coverage / Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Oceania</td>
<td>Australia-New Zealand Closer Economic Relations Trade Agreement (ANZCERTA)</td>
<td>Trans-Tasman Mutual Recognition Arrangement</td>
<td>a person is entitled to practice an equivalent occupation in the other country without the need for further testing or examination</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caribbean</td>
<td>Caribbean Community (CARICOM) Single Market and Economy (CSME)</td>
<td>Arrangements for technical/trade occupations</td>
<td>Applicants can apply for a certificate to go elsewhere and be employed in CARICOM countries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Europe</td>
<td>European Union</td>
<td>European Union Common Labor Market Recognition Arrangements for Trade Professional / Technical Occupations</td>
<td>Upon Issuance of Certificate of Competence based on training or work experience, EU Citizen can move, reside and seek employment within EU. No visas or work permits are required for movement within the EU although residence permits may be required.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Papademetriou, et al. 2015. Achieving Skill Mobility in the ASEAN Economic Community: Challenges, Opportunities, and Policy Implications
Examples of regional cooperation in TVET from outside Asia

**ASEAN MRA System**
- develop mutually recognized professional qualifications
- complete MRAs in identified professions
- develop required core competencies and qualifications for occupations

**European Union**
- Europass
- European Qualifications Framework (EQF)
- European credit system for vocational education and training (ECVET)
- European quality assurance in vocational education and training (EQAVET)

**Caribbean Community (CARICOM)**
- redefining TVET
- developing a CARICOM training system underpinned by a quality assurance framework
TVET IN CAREC: OPPORTUNITIES AND CHALLENGES
Growth in TVET enrolment rates

Figure 3: Proportion of Vocational Enrolment to Total Enrolment in All Programmes at the Secondary Level (%)

Note: The latest year for the global average and regional aggregates is 2016. Percentage of vocational enrolment refers to the total number of students enrolled in vocational programmes at a given level of education, expressed as a percentage of the total number of students enrolled in all programmes (vocational and general) at that level.

ISSUES AND CHALLENGES IN TVET STANDARDIZATION
• **Differences of countries in practice of profession:** Simply signing MRA between governments is not enough. Detailed occupation-by-occupation analysis is necessary.

• **Recognition of school diploma is not the same as recognition of qualifications**
  o For instance, to obtain full qualifications recognition and access to professional practice in Quebec, French-qualified nurses and medical doctors must perform a three-month internship in a Quebec hospital.

• **Negotiation / Recognition Process is a highly complex system and politically difficult because of wide range of stakeholders**

• **Inadequate legislative and institutional frameworks**
PRIORITY AREAS FOR REFORM AND WAY FORWARD
CAREC 2030’s Operational Priorities on Education

- Cross-border accreditation
- Program and degree or diploma harmonization
- Mutual recognition of skills and qualifications
- Development of higher education and TVET institutions networks
- Development of an integrated labor market information system to promote greater labor mobility and match employment opportunities in the region

Developing TVET quality assurance, accreditation systems, and qualification frameworks

Good governance, TVET policy reforms, networking within the region

Improving evidence base for TVET policy and practice
Thank you!

Fahad Khan
Economist, Regional Cooperation and Integration Division
Economic Research and Regional Cooperation Department
Asian Development Bank
Email: fkhan@adb.org